

Te Deum

The Church and Music

PAUL WESTERMEYER

A Textbook

A Reference

A History

An Essay

AUGSBURG FORTRESS | MINNEAPOLIS

*To the students I have been privileged to teach,
from whom I have been privileged to learn.*

TE DEUM
The Church and Music
Paul Westermeyer

Copyright © 1998 Augsburg Fortress. All rights reserved. Except for brief quotations in critical articles or reviews, no part of this book may be reproduced in any manner without prior written permission from the publisher or from the other copyright holders. Write to: Permissions, Augsburg Fortress, P.O. Box 1209, Minneapolis, MN, 55440-1209.

Editors: Norma Aamodt Nelson, Frank Stoldt, Lani Willis
Cover art: *God the Father with Singing and Music-Making Angels* (detail), Hans Memling (c. 1483–1494). Netherlandish. Museum voor Schone Kunsten, Antwerp. Used by permission.
Cover design: David Meyer
Interior design: Ellen Maly

Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
Westermeyer, Paul, 1940–

Te Deum : the church and music / Paul Westermeyer
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical reference and index.

ISBN 0-8006-3146-3 (alk. paper)

1. Music--Religious aspects--Christianity. Music in churches.

3. Public worship. 4. Church music--Protestant churches.

I. Title.

BV290.W47 1998

246'.75'09--dc21

98-4062

CIP

The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of American National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Printed Materials, ANSI Z329.48-1984. ©™

Printed in the USA.

ISBN 978-0-8006-3146-8 (hardcover edition)

ISBN 979-8-8898-3640-7 (paperback edition)

Table of Contents

Abbreviations	vii
Introduction	ix
1. The Study of Church Music	i
OLD TESTAMENT	
2. Prolegomena	9
3. Psalms	23
NEW TESTAMENT	
4. Canticles	39
THE FIRST CENTURIES	
5. With One Voice	59
6. Diffusion	77
BEFORE AND AFTER CHARLEMAGNE	
7. Chant	93
8. Choirs and Thought	111
9. Life and Song	121

REFORMATION CURRENTS

- | | |
|--------------------------------------|-----|
| 10. Sound, Silence, and Strictures | 141 |
| 11. A Wider Spectrum | 161 |
| 12. Controversies Over Psalm Singing | 179 |

AFTER THE REFORMATION

- | | |
|-------------------|-----|
| 13. English Hymns | 201 |
| 14. Music | 222 |

BEFORE AND AFTER THE FRENCH AND AMERICAN REVOLUTIONS

- | | |
|--|-----|
| 15. American Developments | 245 |
| 16. Revivalism, Liturgical Renewal, and Spirituals | 263 |
| 17. Recurrent American Themes and Richer Textures | 289 |

NOW

- | | |
|---------------------|-----|
| 18. Postscript | 311 |
| Chronology | 321 |
| Bibliography | 333 |
| General Index | 367 |
| Biblical References | 411 |

Abbreviations

ABD	The Anchor Bible Dictionary
ANF	The Ante-Nicene Fathers
BH	The Baptist Hymnal, 1991
CCL	Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina
CM	Current Musicology
DH	A Dictionary of Hymnology (Julian)
EH82	The [Episcopal] Hymnal 1982, 1985
HC	The Hymnal 1982 Companion (Glover)
HCSR	Hymnology, A Collection of Source Readings (David Music)
IDB	The Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible
LBW	Lutheran Book of Worship, 1978
LW	Luther's Works
MBE	Music in the Baroque Era (Bukofzer)
MBW	Moravian Book of Worship, 1995
MECL	Music in Early Christian Literature (James McKinnon)
MMA	Music in the Middle Ages (Reese)
MR	Music in the Renaissance (Reese)
NGDAM	New Grove Dictionary of American Music
NGDMI	New Grove Dictionary of Musical Instruments

NGDMM	New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians
NPNF	A Select Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church
PG	Patrologiae cursus completus, Series Graeca
PH	The Presbyterian Hymnal, 1990
PL	Patrologiae cursus completus, Series Latina
RL	Rejoice in the Lord, 1985
SL	Dr. Martin Luthers Sämmtliche Schriften (Saint Louis edition)
SRMH	Source Readings in Music History (Oliver Strunk)
UMH	The United Methodist Hymnal, 1989
WA	Dr. Martin Luthers Werke (Weimar Ausgabe)
WEP	Worship of the English Puritans (Davies)
WTE	Worship and Theology in England (Davies)

Introduction

An earlier book, *The Church Musician*,¹ was stimulated by the need to understand the church musician's role. This book was stimulated by the need to understand church music itself. It began before *The Church Musician* and logically precedes it as context, but was put on hold because it and other projects seemed more pressing.

This book began to take shape after I had taught an interdisciplinary undergraduate course about theology and church music at Elmhurst College a number of times. I used many different texts and readings for the class. All were useful in their own ways, but students expressed frustration at the lack of a single satisfactory introduction to the topic. Teachers of similar courses across the country have shared with me the same frustration: they do not have an adequate introductory text.

The course I taught at Elmhurst College was designed for a variety of persons with a variety of backgrounds. Some students had musical training or were music majors; some had virtually no musical background at all. Some were conversant with theological categories; some knew almost nothing about theology. Some were faithful churchgoers from a variety of confessional backgrounds; some had almost no contact with the church whatsoever; a few wanted no such contact, though this topic intrigued them. Some took the course because of an interest; some did it to fulfill a requirement. A successful textbook for this varied group would have to give an introduction to church music, to the musical and theological issues it raises, and to the materials of its study. It would have to be coherent but brief, understandable but not contemptuously simplistic.

¹ Paul Westermeyer, *The Church Musician* (San Francisco: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1988; rev. ed., Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1997).

After teaching the undergraduate course at Elmhurst for a number of years, I taught a similar one for graduate students enrolled in both Yale University's Institute of Sacred Music and its Divinity School, then briefer but comparable ones at Trinity Seminary in Columbus, Ohio, and the Lutheran School of Theology at Chicago. In each of these instances I again sensed the need for a textbook that did not exist—a basic interdisciplinary introduction to church music for a wide variety of students, including but not limited to future church musicians and pastors. The course I currently teach at Luther Seminary, and to some extent the one at St. Olaf College for undergraduates, have heightened my recognition of the need.

Not only the students in college and seminary classes for whom it was specifically written, but also musicians, pastors, and thoughtful Christians generally may find what is treated here will help them either individually or in study groups. It is intended to provide perspective on a topic that is ever-present, often misunderstood, and upon examination always more complicated than first appearances suggest. I do not mean to imply that this text or any text will be complete or a quick fix for the grid of problems that music can raise in churches, but I hope it introduces the topic, serves as a resource, provides perspective, contributes to solutions, and makes for delight in church music.

In February of 1992 the Laidlaw Lectures at Knox College at the University of Toronto in Canada provided the opportunity to complete initial forms of the chapters on psalmody and the Reformation. The chapter on controversies among the Calvinists about psalm singing had an earlier form in October of 1994 as the Gheens Lecture at Southern Baptist Theological Seminary in Louisville, Kentucky, and was later published in *The Hymn*.² Several articles I have written, cited at the beginning of chapter 15, served as the basis for parts of the last chapters. Other parts were brewing before I taught the church music course at Elmhurst College, especially in research in graduate school at the University of Chicago. Everything has been reworked, most of it written from scratch during a sabbatical in 1996–1997, for which I am grateful to Luther Seminary.

This book seeks to provide a succinct introductory overview to church music from a historical and theological point of view. It is in no sense complete. It is limited by constraints I have set on numbers of pages, what might fit one quarter or semester of study, and what

² Paul Westermeyer, "The Breach Repair'd," *The Hymn* 47:1 (January 1996): 10–16.

relates especially to the English-speaking West as filtered to the United States. It assumes teachers would contract or expand it and does not include detailed musicological, ethnomusicological, sociological, institutional, liturgical, hymnological, or other similar considerations. There could be more chapters, and each chapter could be a whole book. Some things are left out. More thorough studies are available about many of the topics treated here.

This book bears relations to and lives in partnership with, but is not the following:

- a text one might use in a music theory class, though it includes syntactical musical details
- a text one might use in a class devoted solely to theology, though its orientation is theological
- a history or survey of music, such as Karl Gustav Fellerer, *The History of Catholic Church Music*,³ Donald Grout's *A History of Western Music*,⁴ or Andrew Wilson-Dickson's *The Story of Christian Music*,⁵ David Hiley's *Western Plainchant*,⁶ or William Rice's *Concise History of Church Music*,⁷ though it is organized in a historical way
- a music appreciation text such as Joseph Machlis's *The Enjoyment of Music*⁸
- a text about hymnody, such as Eskew and McElrath's *Sing with Understanding*,⁹ Millar Patrick's *The Story of the Church's Song*,¹⁰ or Reynolds and Price's *A Survey of Christian Hymnody*,¹¹ though hymnody comes into play

³ Karl Gustav Fellerer, trans. Francis A. Brunner, *The History of Catholic Church Music* (Baltimore: Helicon Press, 1961).

⁴ Donald Jay Grout and Claude V. Palisca, *A History of Western Music*, 5th ed. (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1996). Any of the Grout editions or any standard history of music will illustrate.

⁵ Andrew Wilson-Dickson, *The Story of Christian Music* (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress, 1996).

⁶ David Hiley, *Western Plainchant: A Handbook* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993).

⁷ William C. Rice, *A Concise History of Church Music* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1964).

⁸ Joseph Machlis, *The Enjoyment of Music*, 4th ed. (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1977). Any of the Machlis editions or any standard music appreciation text will illustrate.

⁹ Harry Eskew and Hugh T. McElrath, *Sing with Understanding: An Introduction to Christian Hymnology* 2d rev. ed. (Nashville: Church Street Press, 1995).

¹⁰ Millar Patrick, rev. James Rawlings Sydnor, *The Story of the Church's Song* (Richmond: John Knox Press, 1962).

¹¹ William J. Reynolds and Milburn Price, *A Survey of Christian Hymnody* (Carol Stream: Hope Publishing Company, 1987).

- a history of ideas about the church's art music like Quentin Faulkner's *Wiser Than Despair*¹²
- what might be called a theology of music: Harold Best's *Music through the Eyes of Faith*,¹³ Archibald Davison's *Church Music: Illusion and Reality*,¹⁴ Edward Foley's *Ritual Music*¹⁵ (a "liturgical musicology"), Joseph Gelineau's *Voices and Instruments in Christian Worship*,¹⁶ Donald Hustad's *Jubilate II*,¹⁷ two texts by Calvin Johansson,¹⁸ Erik Routley's *Church Music and the Christian Faith*,¹⁹ Miriam Therese Winter's *Why Sing?*,²⁰ and *Ears to Hear . . . Tongues to Sing: Church Music as Pastoral Theology*, a work in progress by Francis Williamson
- a "practical" manual as in Lawrence and Ferguson's *A Musician's Guide to Church Music*,²¹ Lovelace's and Rice's *Music and Worship in the Church*,²² Dwight Steere's *Music in Protestant Worship*²³

It bears a similarity to some books that are out of print:

- David Appleby's *History of Church Music*²⁴
- Winfred Douglas's *Church Music in History and Practice*²⁵

¹² Quentin Faulkner, *Wiser Than Despair: The Evolution of Ideas in the Relationship of Music and the Christian Church* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1996). See p. xii.

¹³ Harold M. Best, *Music Through the Eyes of Faith* (New York: Harper, 1993).

¹⁴ Archibald T. Davison, *Church Music: Illusion and Reality* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1960).

¹⁵ Edward Foley, *Ritual Music: Studies in Liturgical Musicology* (Beltsville: The Pastoral Press, 1995).

¹⁶ Joseph Gelineau, *Voices and Instruments in Christian Worship: Principles, Laws, Applications*, trans. Clifford Howell (Collegeville: The Liturgical Press, 1964).

¹⁷ Donald P. Hustad, *Jubilate II: Church Music in Worship and Renewal* (Carol Stream: Hope Publishing Company, 1993).

¹⁸ Calvin M. Johansson, *Discipling Music Ministry* (Peabody: Hendrickson Publishers, 1992); and *Music and Ministry: A Biblical Counterpoint* (Peabody: Hendrickson Publishers, 1984).

¹⁹ Erik Routley, *Church Music and the Christian Faith* (Carol Stream: Agape, 1978).

²⁰ Miriam Therese Winter, *Why Sing? Toward a Theology of Catholic Church Music* (Washington: The Pastoral Press, 1984).

²¹ Joy E. Lawrence and John A. Ferguson, *A Musician's Guide to Church Music* (New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1981).

²² Austin C. Lovelace and William C. Rice, *Music and Worship in the Church* (New York: Abingdon Press, 1960).

²³ Dwight Steere, *Music in Protestant Worship* (Richmond: John Knox Press, 1960).

²⁴ David P. Appleby, *History of Church Music* (Chicago: Moody Press, 1965).

²⁵ Winfred Douglas, rev. Leonard Ellinwood, *Church Music in History and Practice: Studies in the Praise of God* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1961).

- Charles Etherington's *Protestant Worship Music*²⁶
- C. Henry Phillips's *The Singing Church*²⁷
- Erik Routley's *The Church and Music*²⁸
- Russel N. Squire's *Church Music*²⁹ and
- Robert Stevenson's *Patterns of Protestant Church Music*.³⁰

It also has affinities with Edward Foley's *From Age to Age*, which fortunately is in print, but it does not attempt Foley's continuity and does not cover the additional elements of architecture, books, and vessels.³¹

It threads its way among these approaches as a relatively brief overview³² of some themes or chapters in the history of church music, a theological essay with the people's song the central concern. It does not avoid the music itself, but I am more concerned about what stands behind the music, reasons for or against it, restrictions placed on it, or what has pushed it one way or another. If you discover something of the church's encounter with music in worship before we came on the scene, my intent will have been realized. The book is designed to raise some of the issues church music raises and to meet the needs I have faced in my classrooms. I hope others will find it useful in their classes as well, flexible enough to be adapted in part or whole by teachers for a wide variety of people from many different backgrounds, with enough suggestions in the footnotes and bibliography for further study in sources that are as accessible as possible.

Though this is conceived as a text and resource book you probably will not find it a dispassionate analysis. I hope not anyway. The topic is more interesting than that, and a survey of details doesn't help learning very much. I have some opinions. I'm not sure I can

²⁶ Charles L. Etherington, *Protestant Worship Music: Its History and Practice* (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1962).

²⁷ C. Henry Phillips, *The Singing Church: An Outline History of the Music Sung by Choir and People* (London: Faber and Faber Ltd., 1945).

²⁸ Erik Routley, *The Church and Music: An Enquiry into the History, the Nature, and the Scope of Christian Judgment on Music* (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co. Ltd., 1950). The quotation is from p. 9.

²⁹ Russel N. Squire, *Church Music: Musical and Hymnological Developments in Western Christianity* (St. Louis: The Bethany Press, 1962).

³⁰ Robert M. Stevenson, *Patterns of Protestant Church Music* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1953).

³¹ Edward Foley: *From Age to Age: How Christians Celebrated the Eucharist* (Chicago: Liturgy Training Publications, 1991).

³² Not brief in the sense of Kenneth W. Osbeck, *The Endless Song: 13 Lessons in Music and Worship of the Church* (Grand Rapids: Kregel Publications, 1987).

hide them, and I'm not sure I want to hide them. There's a narrative here, written from my perspective in my time and place, with no apologies. I'll insert opinions from time to time—not solutions, but opinions. I hope they'll encourage you to grapple with the issues yourself, argue with me and the others we encounter along the way, and figure out what you think. The book is organized historically to keep it disciplined by the data and to provide perspective. I have attempted to be as accurate as possible and am grateful for and of necessity dependent on the work of many scholars and secondary sources. Anyone who wants to can work through the secondary sources to the primary ones and correct what I may have gotten wrong. That is only the first step, however. Meaning behind and beyond the details is the central concern about which I hope I have contributed to some dialogue.

Students have often requested a time line. The one given here is by no means complete. It includes mostly nonmusical entries to set things in context. Musical entries are sprinkled in with broader currents. The skeletal character of the list should allow you to weave in your own specific concerns.

I am deeply indebted to teachers and colleagues across almost four decades with whom I have studied and discussed many of the topics treated here. If I have unconsciously used some of their phrases, that should be read as a tribute, not a slight. I have tried to give credit where it is due and hope I have not missed something.

I owe the library staff at Luther Seminary a strong word of gratitude, especially Terry Dinovo, Bruce Eldevik, and Julie Bickel. Librarians are the salt of the earth, as a group the most gracious and competent people I know. Without them we who teach could not do our jobs. While working on this book I have plagued the three just named with continual requests, sometimes obscure ones, and they have always responded efficiently and cheerfully. I am most appreciative of their knowledge, kindness, and hard work.

Numerous friends and colleagues have graciously read and critiqued initial drafts of various portions of the book: David Cherwien, Susan Cherwien, John Ferguson, Terrence Fretheim, Fred Gaiser, Kenneth Hart, Sarah Henrich, Mark Hillmer, Arland Hultgren, James Limburg, Daniel Simundson, and John Witvliet. I have had conversations and correspondence about it with Gerhard Cartford, Carl Schalk, and May Schwarz. In his characteristic way, Martin Marty read the whole book and made some of the most perceptive and helpful comments, both in details and overall perspective. My friend Francis Williamson, with whom I have had dis-

cussions about church music since seminary days, also read the whole manuscript. As usual, he forcefully challenged me with pages of closely reasoned suggestions. The students in my church music class at Luther Seminary the first quarter of the 1997–98 academic year used the book, made corrections, and raised questions from their various perspectives. None of these people bears responsibility for the final text, which is mine, but their suggestions have forced me to rethink and rework things for the better. I am indebted to them all.

The Church Musician was dedicated to the choirs and congregations I have served. This book is dedicated to my students. As the choirs and congregations helped me hammer out the role of the church musician, so my students have helped me search out the nature of church music. To them I am profoundly grateful.

Paul Westermeyer

7 December 1997

Commemoration of Ambrose, Bishop of Milan, 397